Lecture 6: LeMay Chapter 5 - Strategy of Separatism

I. Economic and Political Paths are not the only strategies

a. Separation is also an option: Physical and/or Psychological

b. Why would a group decide to separate itself?

- disenchancement of the dominant political and cultural system
- if the group is very different from the majority
- if the group has experience extreme levels of hostility from the public or government or both

c. Is this a Successful strategy? why/why not?

- Most new movements don't survive a single generation
- but, if culture and practices are very different
- If they develop distinct organizations
- Small in size
- Leadership
- Some way of solving the collective action problem

II. Which groups have chosen this path?

Amish and Mennonites, the Mormons, Native Americans, and black Americans who followed Marcus Garvey.

a. Amish & Mennonites: Have struggled for over 400 years to maintain their separate culture. Small in size – 81,000 Amish; 92,000 Mennonites

1) how did they maintain separation?
• Symbolization of core values
• Centralized leadership
• Social sanctions
• Comprehensive socialization;
• Controlled interaction with outsiders
• Limited education (upheld by Wisconsin v. Yoder 1972)
• [Jesus Camp]

2) Have they been successful?
• Old Order Amish have continued to lose members to more liberal groups.
• They were, but economic changes; suburbia has changed their lifestyles. No longer farmers.
• Separation does not mean they can exclude themselves from the laws and obligations of the dominant group [enlistment to armed services.

b. Mormons – native born minority (rather than an immigrant);

Why did the Mormons choose separation? experienced high levels of repressive discrimination. Pushed out of New York, Ohio, Missouri, Illinois

Why did the Mormons meet such hostility? Religious differences are often the most salient. Also, the cultural practices of the Mormons were threatening or strange to the dominant society (Brigham Young ultimately has 70 wives; anti-semitic, anti-black attitudes).

Was this strategy successful for the Mormons?
• Yes. It was more than a religion, it was a way of life and still remains distinct from other Christian sects.
• No. Most Mormons are "mainstream" and such mainstreaming have arguably made their lives much better.

c. Native Americans

40 percent of those identifying themselves as Native American live off reservations.

Have they been successful in Separation? Yes – The reservation program (legal vs. informal separation) was imposed on them. In addition, Genocide, discrimination, forced them to separate. Also, because they were not immigrants, they had a strong argument that they should not have to assimilate.

Although, U.S. government did have a change of heart and adopted a policy of forced assimilation in 1879. Under President Eisenhower implemented relocation and termination programs. These plans encouraged Native Americans to move off the reservations and into major cities. The policies were designed to liquidate Indian land and officially end federal treaties and agreements. Terminating the relationship between the federal government and Indian communities would mean that tribes would lose special relationships they had been given under federal law, including the tax-exempt status of their land and federal responsibility for Native economic and social well-being.

Has this been a successful strategy? Lowest income and education levels, worst housing and health conditions or any minority group.

d. Black Nationalism

Marcus Garvey: Born in Jamaica, educated in England, became a writer and newspaper publisher. Moved to the U.S. in 1916 when
he was 28. Founded in 1920 the Universal Negro Improvement Association (UNIA). Proposed moving African Americans to African and form a colony (with support from the Liberian government). Had support, not surprising, of many white public officials.

Was it successful? No – Garvey badly disregarded the sensibilities of the majority of American blacks. The Liberian government changed its attitude and opposed the colonization plan.

III. Psychological Separation

Black Muslims:

   Establish unity
   Self-defense
   Education
   Political power (within the system)
   Economic power (within the system)
   Change Social setting (Crime)
   Adopt African Culture

Hesidic Jews

Christian Evangelicals?

IV. Conclusion

Is it Easier for Religious groups to separate or racial groups? Why?

Timing: Native Americans were here since the beginning;
Anabaptists began in 1525; Mormons 1830; Marcus Garvey 1920s